

## Research Report: Venetian *Ospedali*, Setting the Record Straight

Because the topic of the Venetian *Ospedali* is dear to my heart and scholarly work, I read with interest Christopher Eanes' article, in the February issue of the *Choral Journal*, "Angels of Song: An Introduction to Musical Life at the Venetian *Ospedali*." Regrettably, I, among other authors, am even quoted incorrectly throughout the article, and credited for information I have never presented. While Mr. Eanes' article refers to many interesting topics related to the *Ospedali*, he has made a number of major and cumulatively significant minor errors as demonstrated in Table 1.

Table 1

Item	Errata: Eanes	Original Source Jane Berdes <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i>
1. Inaccurate information	Page 72, column 1, paragraph 2  "The Mendicanti, <b>founded in the twelfth century as a hospital for Crusaders...</b> "	In the twelfth century, it was not yet the Mendicanti, and never was a hospital for Crusaders.  "...the <b>pre-history</b> of the oldest of the <i>ospedali</i> - the Mendicanti- dates from the activity in Venice during the twelfth century of the Chevaliers de L'Ordre de Saint Lazare de Jerusalem. <sup>4</sup> (fn 4 is Jane Berdes's, p. 46) In footnote 4, Jane Berdes explains that the Chevaliers de L'Ordre de Saint Lazare de Jerusalem ... maintained hostels for pilgrims on the way to the Holy Land." <sup>1</sup>  "In the <i>thirteenth century</i> it became the first leper colony in history, and was reorganized towards the close of the sixteenth century into a post-Tridentine welfare foundation." <sup>2</sup>
2. Incomplete And Inaccurate Information: Mendicanti	Page 72, column 1, paragraph 2.  "The Mendicanti, founded in the twelfth century as a hospital for Crusaders <b>eventually became a refuge for Venice's</b> <b>beggars,</b>	"The number of residents at the Mendicanti, which had a capacity of four hundred adults and one hundred children, was composed of <b>beggars, and their families, fatherless children of both genders, widows, retired men and women of the working class, the sick, and patrician elderly.</b> " <sup>3</sup>
3. Inaccurate and incomplete information: Incurabili	while the Incurabili was founded to serve those suffering from syphilis, as well as "repentant prostitutes." <sup>3*</sup>	"On 16 June 1531, the year of conferring of monastic status on the Incurabili, the Venetian Patriarch capitalized on papal jurisdictional initiatives by directing the Incurabili to take under its care two new types of client: <b>repentant prostitutes and sixteen girls from the noble and citizen classes whose parents could not afford to educate them properly.</b> Thus the educational mandate of a female seminary was made an appendage to the Incurabili." <sup>4</sup>  Jane Berdes describes in the next paragraph the four sectors of the population demographics of the Incurabili.  " <i>Ospedale</i> or infirmary (care of the sick- male and female) <i>Orphanotrophium</i> (33 boys from the age of seven upwards) <i>Donne peccatrici a Dio convertiti</i> (former prostitutes) <i>Figlie d'educazione</i> (young girls who were placed in the <i>ospedale</i> for their education and whose section of the <i>ospedale</i> constituted a <i>conservatorio</i> )" <sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Jane L. Baldauf-Berdes, *Women Musicians of Venice Musical Foundations 1525-1855*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993. p. 46.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 2.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 61. Source is Tiepolo et al, (eds.), *Difesa della sanità*, 115

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 55-56.

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 56

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i> , 48
4. Inaccurate information: Pietà	Page 72, column 2, paragraph 2 "Founded in 1336 by a Franciscan Friar named Pietro of Assisi, the Pietà accepted <b>any infant of illegitimate birth</b> , whom the anonymous mother could leave in a box (called a <i>scaffetta</i> ), providing the child was still small enough to fit." <sup>5</sup>	<b>All infants were accepted into the Pietà without conditions or questions. Admission was by deposit in a revolving drawer, the scaffetta, located inconspicuously in the exterior wall of the home.</b>  [Given the scenario in which he describes the <i>scaffetta</i> , he does not explain how legitimacy could be verified.]
5. Inaccurate documentation (fn 5) Cites Whittemore instead of Berdes		He erroneously attributes the source of his information to Joan Whittemore's dissertation, page 6 when the <i>scaffetta</i> is actually described in Jane Berdes' <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i> , page 48, paragraph 2.

Item	Eanes	Joan Whittemore, "Revision of Music ..."
6. Inaccurate documentation (fn 6) Cites Berdes instead of Whittemore	Page 72, column 2, paragraph 2 "There were no limits on the number of children taken in, and by the eighteenth century it [the Pietà] housed more than 4000." <sup>6*</sup>	This information is not in Berdes.  That information is found on page 6 of the "Revision of Music performed at the Venetian <i>Ospedali</i> in the Eighteenth Century." University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1986, not in Berdes, 48.

Item	Eanes	Joan Whittemore, "Revision of Music ..." Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians</i> (242-243) addressed the issue of misinformation spread by Thomas Coyat and Percy Scholes.
7. Unfounded Statement	Page 72, column 3 and footnote 7 "It did not go unnoticed of course, that patrons were more generous with their offerings in the presence of glorious music performed by such (seemingly) chaste young women." <sup>7</sup>	There is no explanation for the parenthetical insertion "seemingly," a snide comment, Moreover, it is erroneously attributed to Joan Whittemore whose work on page 21 does not address the moral character of the <i>figlie del coro</i> , and which reads
8. Inaccurate documentation		"A table of the <i>maestri di cappella</i> at San Marco and the <i>maestro di coro</i> at the four <i>ospedali</i> is included here. There were numerous maestri who, like, Giovanni Rovetta, Giovanni Legrenzi, Ferdinando Bertoni, Baldassare Galuppi, Bonaventura Furlanetto, and Agostino Perotti, maintained posts at San Marco simultaneously with a position at an <i>ospedale</i> ." etc.

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i> (113)
9. Inaccurate terminology: <i>figlie di coro</i>	p. 73 column 1, line 7 "Visitors flocked to the canals to witness the Carnival celebrations, take in one of the dozen or so operas produced each season, and of course, to make a pilgrimage to hear the <b><i>figlie di coro</i></b> ."	On p. 73 Eanes first uses the term <i>figlie di coro</i> without explanation. The term should be <i>figlie del coro</i> . (See item 12 below.)

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i> (113)
10. Inaccurate terminology: <i>maestro di coro</i> reserved for the <i>Ospedali</i> not for San Marco	p. 74 column 3, paragraph 3 “Baldassare Galuppi obviously considered a post at the <i>ospedali</i> to be desirable even after he had attained considerable fame throughout Europe, for he accepted a position at the Incurabili in 1762 at the ripe old age of 56; he held this position concurrently with that of <i>maestro di coro</i> at the Basilica di San Marco.”	<i>Maestro di coro</i> is reserved for an <i>Ospedale</i> while <i>maestro di cappella</i> is the term for San Marco.  Galuppi was <b>thirty-four when he became <i>maestro di coro</i> at the Mendicanti (1740-51)</b> He was <i>maestro di coro</i> at the Incurabili (1762-65, 1768-76) and Vice- <i>maestro di cappella</i> at San Marco (1748-62) <i>Maestro di cappella</i> (1762-65, 1768-1785) <sup>6</sup>
11. Incomplete information		

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i>
12. Mistranslates <i>figlia di coro</i>	On page 75, column 1, lines 3-4, he uses the term in the singular ( <i>figlia di coro</i> ,) and mistranslates it as “ <b>literally choir girl.</b> ”	“ <i>Figlia di coro</i> (daughter of the chorus) referred to the “women musicians elected to specific posts in the <i>cori</i> , such as that of concert mistress ( <i>maestra di primo violino</i> ) or of a teacher of the violin ( <i>maestra di violino</i> ). <i>Figlia del coro</i> includes any member of an <i>ospedale coro</i> or orchestra distinguishing them from the other females in the <i>ospedale</i> , the <i>figlia della casa</i> or <i>figlia del commune</i> , who were not musicians.” <sup>7</sup>

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i>
13. Inaccurate information and citation	page 76, column 1, line 6 Eanes erroneously asserts that  “ <b>many</b> of the <i>figlie</i> went on to have successful careers in opera,” without identifying any performers who had such careers.”	To the contrary, Jane Berdes states that <sup>8</sup>  The third vow concerned <i>figlie del coro</i> who chose to leave the <i>ospedale</i> at the end of twenty years or more spent there as apprentices and professional musicians in order to marry. It was a solemn promise made by the <i>figlie del coro</i> and their prospective spouses that <b>the church musicians would never again perform in public.</b> <sup>147</sup> Jane Berdes’s source (fn 147) is the repository of the Derelitti and Mendicanti archives as compiled and edited by Giuseppe Ellero, the former archivist for the Istituto di Ricovero e di Educazione and the current archivist for the Ospedale della Pietà. <sup>9</sup>
14. Berdes reports the exact opposite	He does not identify any performers who had such careers.	Jane Berdes identifies Faustina Bordoni (Hasse’s wife), who came to the <i>ospedali</i> for training (p. 118 ), Maddalena Lombardini-Sirmen, the famed violinist-harpsichordist, composer, and student of Giuseppe Tartini, who performed minor operatic roles in Dresden, and other <i>figlie de spese</i> (fee-paying students) at the <i>ospedali</i> including Giustiana Wynne and Nancy Storace (p. 182). <sup>10</sup>

<sup>6</sup> Joan Whittemore, “Revision of Music performed at the Venetian *Ospedali* in the Eighteenth Century.” University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1986, 87.

<sup>7</sup> Berdes 113.

<sup>8</sup> Berdes, 143, 159-160.

<sup>9</sup> I-Vire, Der, B, 13, perg. 139, nn. 3-5: 25 Aug. 1766, as cited in Ellero et al. (eds.), *Arte e musica*, 75-76.

<sup>10</sup> Berdes, 120, 146, 149, 160, 166.

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes , <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i>
15. Incomplete Information	<p>page 76, column 2, paragraph 2</p> <p><i>“Membership in the larger coro at all of the ospedali was generally limited to symbolic number”</i></p>	<p>Eanes states that the membership of the <i>cori</i> is based on a “symbolic number...,” and cites the <i>Incurabili</i> and <i>Derelitti</i>. The evidence shows that there were several symbolic numbers, but that the practice was not followed consistently.</p> <p><i>“Of the seventy females accepted into the musical section of the Incurabili, thirty-three were actually said to be in the coro. Each figlia del coro was to signify a year in the life spent on earth by Christ....</i></p> <p><i>Actually the coro at the Incurabili, where the population was limited to six hundred, including a hundred children, represented slightly more than 10 per cent of the total. The coro declined in size from sixty-three in 1624 to fifty-seven in 1642, and climbed to sixty-five 1760.</i></p> <p><i>The membership of the coro at the Pietà was supposedly limited to the symbolic number of forty... ..there were 106 in 1624, 151 in 1633, 78 in 1644, etc.</i></p> <p><i>The Derelitti.... Officially maintained thirty-two figlie del coro and a maestro di coro in 1624.</i></p> <p><i>..at the Mendicanti the coro consisted of 94 members in 1624, 134 in 1633, 107 in 1642....”<sup>11</sup></i></p>

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i>
16. Misleading information leading to an inaccurate conclusion.	<p>p. 77, column 2, paragraph 3,</p> <p><i>“Even a quick browse through the repertoire from the ospedali confronts us with a point of interest: much of the repertoire is written for SATB choir...”</i></p>	<p>Eanes does not identify the source of these manuscripts, the composers, the <i>ospedale</i> for whom they were written, the decades they represent, or even the number he has “browsed through,” in order to make this judgment. The type of <i>notated</i> scoring in surviving manuscripts varies according to the composer, and which <i>ospedale</i> used and preserved the manuscript. SATB notation does not of itself mean SATB performance. The available repertoire represents only a small portion of the total output; perhaps more than eighty per cent of the repertoire no longer exists.<sup>12</sup> Jane Berdes relates C.G. Botta’s eyewitness account of the scene at the <i>Mendicanti</i> on 16 May, 1797, the last day of the Venetian Republic.</p> <p>With my own eyes, many years ago, [I saw] books and manuscripts being thrown from the windows of that place [<i>Ospedale dei Mendicanti</i>] into waiting boats and transported away by speculators who did not realize what they were taking. O, Venice! Weep not over the fact that the treasures which your genius has brought forth, for your glory rather than for your misfortune, are now taken away to adorn and enrich other countries. Your original and inalienable genius remains still with you, so that you may always create treasures in abundance.<sup>13</sup></p>

<sup>11</sup> Berdes, 125-126.

<sup>12</sup> Joan Whittemore lists nearly 1300 manuscripts in *Music of the Venetian Ospedali Composers: A Thematic Catalogue*, but not all manuscripts can be identified as *Ospedali* repertoire at this time, Jane Berdes has documented in Appendix 6 Provisional Inventory of the Liturgical and Non-liturgical Sacred, Secular, and Instrumental Music Composed for and performed at the *Ospedali Grandi* (1598-1855), pp. 242-456 of the forthcoming *Guide to Ospedali Research*, 2357 manuscripts of both sacred and secular music that include the repertoire from Whittemore..

<sup>13</sup> C.G. Botta, *Storia d’Italia dal 1789 al 1824* (4 vols.; Paris, 1824; Venice, 1826); as cited in Berdes, 42, fn. 50.

Item	Eanes	Joan Whittemore, "Revision of Music" 1986 ; <i>CJ</i> 1993
17. Misrepresentation of the facts regarding the performance of SATB repertoire at the <i>Ospedali</i>	<p>p. 77, column 2, paragraph 3 last sentence – through column 3</p> <p>“Unfortunately, the overwhelming majority of historical studies of the <i>ospedali</i> avoid the question completely, since it is, to understate the case, a complex issue. However, if the goal of historical scholarship is to inform performance, it would seem vital to attack this question head on.”</p>	<p>Evidence replaced speculation regarding this subject in 1986. Prior to Jane Berdes’s dissertation of 1989 and Joan Whittemore’s dissertation of 1986, <i>Ospedale</i> research existed in piecemeal by authors who focused on one aspect — a composer or a specific group of manuscripts, etc. Jane Berdes placed the <i>Ospedali</i>, their history, culture, musical contribution, <i>maestri</i>, and above all, more than eight hundred <i>figlie del coro</i> in their appropriate context.</p> <p>Evidence such as manuscripts of a composer’s work in multiple versions, documentation of correspondence between <i>ospedale</i> governors and composers regarding the practice of revising music from SATB to SSAA and vice versa, examination of more than thirteen hundred manuscripts of <i>ospedale maestri</i>, thirty-seven musical examples, and a complete edition of Antonio Vivaldi’s <i>Beatus vir</i> (RV 598) were required, presented as evidence, and approved by the doctoral thesis final examination committee. Speculation held no place in “attacking this question head on.”</p>

Item	Eanes	Joan Whittemore, "Revision of Music" 1986;1993 <i>CJ</i>
18. Inaccurate Information	<p>Page 77, column 3, paragraph 3</p> <p>“Scholars who have dared to weigh in on this issue seem to agree that there are three possible explanations:”</p>	<p>Mr. Eanes does not identify the scholars in this paragraph. Three pages later (page 80, column 2) he does cite the eminent Vivaldi scholar, Michael Talbot and the equally distinguished Bach scholar and conductor of the Taverner Consort and Players, Andrew Parrott whose name he misspells (page 81, footnote 33). With all due respect to the invaluable contributions to musicology and performance practice of Michael Talbot, he has considered only the manuscripts of Vivaldi’s music and not the manuscripts preserving the music of other composers for other <i>ospedali</i>.</p> <p>This matters because Vivaldi’s <i>ospedale</i> music is preserved in sources created for the Pietà. Andrew Parrott specializes in the music of Bach and has not examined the music of other <i>ospedali</i> composers. Furthermore, Mr. Eanes cites Andrew Parrott’s recording of Vivaldi’s Magnificat in G Minor in footnote 34. The manuscript that Andrew Parrott used is identified on the recording as RV 610b preserved in the Prague (Osek monastery) which is actually a copy of a set of parts of the earliest version that precedes the Giordano 35 autograph catalogued by Peter Ryom, (RV 610, RV 610 a, and RV 611). The solos in the Parrott recording are those of the earlier (Prague) version. The Giordano 35 autograph, not the Prague manuscript, contains the five solos written for the <i>figlie del coro</i> (c. 1739) at the Ospedale della Pietà.<sup>14</sup> Vivaldi made fifteen changes in the choral writing in the Giordano 35 autograph for the <i>figlie del coro</i>.</p>

<sup>14</sup> Joan Whittemore, “Revision Repertoire of the *Ospedali Veneziani*,” *Choral Journal*, March, 1994, Vol. 34, No. 8, 11-12.

Items	Eanes	Joan Whittemore, "Revision of Music" 1986;1993 <i>CJ</i>
19. Inaccurate information	<p>Page 77, column 3, paragraph 3</p> <p>"Scholars who have dared to weigh in on this issue seem to agree that there are three possible explanations:</p> <p><i>"(1) the women sang the tenor and bass parts at the notated pitch;"</i></p> <p><i>(2) the women sang either or both the tenor and bass parts transposed up one or two octaves;</i></p> <p><i>(3) the tenor and bass parts were never intended to be sung by the women of the ospedali, and were simply omitted."</i></p>	<p>There is no specific evidence for the performance of tenor or bass parts by female singers at the <i>ospedali</i>. There is a very small amount of evidence that one (or how many?) singer(s) at some other time could sing in those registers. Evidence that this <i>might</i> have been possible or <i>might</i> be possible today is irrelevant. All known evidence supports the conclusion that no male singers performed with the <i>figlie del coro</i>. The other hard evidence about vocal scoring supports the conclusion that the music was sung SSAA, regardless of how it was notated.</p> <p>Since the range of the voice is determined by the length and thickness of the vocal cords and concomitant hormonal development, Mr. Eanes' solution for conductors to "teach their girls and adult women to access their lower register" (p. 80, column 2, last sentence) is faulty pedagogically. There is no need to risk vocal health to attempt to emulate an anomaly that <i>may have occurred in some instances</i>. There are lovely extant pieces in SSAA editions currently and in preparation, and more repertoire that can be revised for modern performance. The goal is to follow the appropriate performance practice of the period for each work insofar as it is possible, and maintain good vocal health in our singers. Nicola Porpora (1686-1768), regarded as the finest singing teacher of the age, was <i>maestro di coro</i> at three of the <i>Ospedali</i>. This was after all, the age of <i>bel canto</i>.</p>
20. Inaccurate information	<p>Page 77, column 3, paragraph 3</p> <p><i>"(2) the women sang either or both the tenor and bass parts transposed up one or two octaves;"</i></p>	<p>One octave upward transposition is documented in the research. Two octave upward transposition is not documented.</p>

Items	Eanes	Joan Whittemore, "Revision of Music" 1986
21. Inaccurate Information	Page 77, column 3, paragraph 3  "3) <i>the tenor and bass parts were never intended to be sung by the women of the ospedali, and were simply omitted.</i> "	No researcher has ever presented any actual documentation to support the speculative idea that in performance the notated tenor and bass parts were simply omitted. If we assume as Mr. Eanes posits that "the tenor and bass parts were never intended to be sung by the women of the <i>ospedali</i> , and were simply omitted, then we would be faced with the highly improbable corollary that the Pietà collected SATB works that they intended to perform without the vocal tenor and bass parts, while other <i>ospedali</i> collected and/or revised works so that the SATB voicing yielded to a usable SSAA voicing, which they performed without omitting vocal parts. But that stark difference in practice seems highly unlikely.  Furthermore, the music that the <i>maestri</i> were required to provide for an <i>Ospedale</i> and for which they were paid became the property of the <i>Ospedale</i> . That the revision process was widespread is evident because the governors of the Ospedaletto (Derelitti) in 1745 called Porpora to task for doing so. Porpora's response to the governors assures them that the music he has provided for the Derelitti is all new and invites them to examine the manuscripts. <sup>15</sup> Yet, if one were to study Porpora's extant autographs, it is possible to see how quickly Porpora could revise an SATB composition and pass it off as a new SSAA version. So even if he presented a copyist an autograph manuscript, it could still be a revision. <sup>16</sup>  Then, too, since there are numerous extant manuscripts scored for SATB with <i>figlie del coro</i> names written in on the tenor and bass parts, no one else can state with impunity that " <i>the tenor and bass parts were never intended to be sung by the women of the ospedali, and were simply omitted.</i> "

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i>
22. In accurate information  23. Misspells "choruses"	p. 78, column 1, paragraph 1  Charles Burney*  "....as the <b>chorusses</b> [sic]* are wholly made up of female voices, they are never in more than three parts, often only two...."	Included here (Example 1) is a list of forty preserved <i>ospedali</i> manuscripts, many of which are autographs of four-part writing (SSAA) and even (SSAA/SSAA) from the period of 1720 through the 1770s. Eanes relies too heavily on the words of visitors like Charles Burney. As valuable as these reports are, they are the words of visitors, not the governors, nor the <i>maestri di coro</i> , the <i>figlie del coro</i> , the scribes, nor anyone who had first-hand experience of the manner in which these institutions were governed or how the <i>cori</i> functioned.  *Eanes' misspelling, not Burney's. *Burney reference is C. Burney, Dr. Burney's Musical Tours in Europe (London, 1859), i. 112-116 as cited in Berdes, 224, 227.

<sup>15</sup> Arch. IRE. Der. G.2.N.48, fascicolo *Musica*, insert 49, letter of Nicola Porpora to governors of the Ospedaletto 1745 as cited in Giuseppe Ellero, *Arte e Musica al'Ospedaletto. Schede d'archivio dull'attivit  musical degli ospedali dei Derelitti e dei Mendicanti di Venezia (sec. XVI-XVIII)*. Venice: Stamperia di Venezia Editrice, 1978, p. 127-128.

<sup>16</sup> Extant works in multiple versions include David Larson's editions of Baldassare Galuppi's *Dixit Dominus* of 1775 written for the Incurabili and revised for the ducal chapel of San Marco in 1781, both published by Roger Dean. Johann Adolph Hasse's *Miserere* in C Minor written in the 1730s for the Incurabili, and *Miserere* in D Minor also for the Incurabili in the 1730s. Documentation for the location of these manuscripts can be found in *Music of the Venetian Ospedali Composers: A Thematic Catalogue*. Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1995.

Example 1. Extant *Ospedali* (SSAA, SSA/SSA, SSAA/SSAA) manuscripts from the 1720s to the late 1770s.

Composer	Title	Voicing	Date	Ospedali	Manuscript Source
Andrea Bernasconi	Laudate undecima	SSSS/SSSS	1750	Pietà	I-Vc B. 18 N 5 =A=W660 <sup>17</sup>
Domenico Cimarosa	Miserere	SSAA/SSAA		Incurabili	Gb-Lbm Add. 14402 A=W550
Baldassare Galuppi	Confitebor	SSAA	1762	Incurabili	I Vsm C5 B5 A = W344
	Confitebor	SSAA	1770	Incurabili	I Vsm C5 B5 A = W345
	Laudate pueri	SSAA/SSAA	1763	Incurabili	I Vsm C5 B5 A = W354
	Laudate pueri	SSAA	1769	Incurabili	I Vsm C5 B5 A = W355
	Laudate pueri	SSA/SSA	1774	Incurabili	I-Vsm C5 B5 A = W356
	In convertendo	SSAA	1772	Incurabili	I Vsm C5 B5 A = W350
	Dixit Dominus	SSAA	1775	Incurabili	I-UD, S = A=W 1106; I-G N. 1.11 (Sc.38) = A= W1107
	Miserere	SSAA	1776	Incurabili	I Vsm C5 B5 A=W357
	Nunc dimittis	SSAA	1773	Incurabili	I Vsm C5 B5A= W358
	Credo	SSAA	1778	Incurabili	I Vnm IV c 999 10776
Johann Adolph Hasse	Miserere C Minor	SSAA	1730s	Incurabili	I-MC M S. 489 = W 552, 1018, 1096, 1160
	Miserere D Minor	SSAA	1730s	Incurabili	I- MC MS 487 = W1019
	Tollite hostias*	SSAA		Incurabili	DDR-Dlb 2477/E/19 = A
Niccolo Jommelli	Mass*F Major	SSAA	1745	Incurabili	GB-Lbm Add. 14139 = W566, 1035 DDR-Dlb 3032/D/4 olim 190c = A= W1035
	Confirma hoc	SSAA		Incurabili	I Cini Venezia 9 W623
Gaetano Pampani	Confitebor	SSAA		Derelitti	I-Urb-Cap
	In convertendo	SSAA		Derelitti	I-Urb-Cap
Nicola Porpora	Beatus vir	SSAA	1726	Incurabili	I GBM Add. 14126 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =W581
	Beatus vir	SSAA	1744	Derelitti	F-Pn MS 2423 = W1112
	Confitebor*	SSAA	1745	Derelitti	US-U M040498 =A=W1067
	Credidi* A Major	SSAA	1745	Derelitti	GB-Lbm Add. 14131=A = W585
	Cum Invocarem	SSAA	1726	Incurabili	I GBM Add. 14127 Us-U ms M2.1 M104=A=W586
	De profundis	SSAA	1744	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14128 Us-U ms M2.1 M104=A=W587
	Dixit Dominus	SSAA	1745		D-Winterfield 66 W115
	Domine probasti	SSAA	1745	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14126 Us-U ms M2.1 M104=A=W589
	In convertendo	SSAA	1745	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14126 Us-U ms M2.1 M104=A=W 590
	In exitu Israel	SSA/SSA	1744	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14125 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A=W591
	In te speravi	SSAA	1744	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14126 Us-U ms M2.1 M104=A=W593
	Laetatus sum	SSAA	1744	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14126 Us-U ms M2.1 M104= A=W595
	Laetatus sum	SSAA	1746	Derelitti	US-Mus Mayer-Baer 233-241
	Lauda Jerusalem	SSAA	1744	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14129 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A= W597
	Lauda Jerusalem	SSAA	1745	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14129 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A=W598
	Laudate pueri	SSAA	1745	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14128 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A=W600
	Laudate pueri	SSAA	1746	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14129 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A=W601
	Laudate pueri	SSAA	1749	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14128 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A=W602
	Nisi Dominus	SSAA	1744	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14126 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A=W603
	Qui habitat	SSAA	1744	Derelitti	I GBM Add. 14128 Us-U ms M2.1 M104 =A=W602
	Magnificat in A Minor	SSAA	1745	Derelitti	D-Winterfield 66

<sup>17</sup> “A” means this is an autograph manuscript. “W” refers to the number in *Music of the Venetian Ospedali Composers: A Thematic Catalogue*. Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1995.

Item	Eanes	Joan Whittemore
24. Inaccurate information	<p>page 80, column 1</p> <p>“current research is leading us to the surprising conclusion that, in fact, there were women in the <i>ospedali</i> that sang the bass and tenor parts at pitch. Researcher Micky White (<b>who even went so far as to move into the Pietà</b>), notes that there can be no mistaking the vocal range, as the names of the singers, such as “Anna del basso” were often written into the part books.”</p>	<p>Micky White is a British photo-journalist- researcher who moved to <b>Venice</b> in 1996 to conduct research at the Pietà.</p> <p>Giuseppe Ellero, the archivist at the Pietà, reported (in a private presentation July 15, 2007 at the archive of the Pietà) that residency at the Pietà is reserved for families in need of the social services offered by the government.</p> <p>Since many of the <i>figlie del coro</i> were instrumentalists and singers, their identities could result from <i>either</i> the instrument they played or the part they sang. Even if a part were written in the bass clef of a part book, it does not of itself prove that the singer sang the part at that pitch.<sup>18</sup></p>

Item	Eanes	Joan Whittemore, “Revision of Music” 1986 ; <i>CJ</i> 1993
25. Inaccurate representation of the facts and misreading of evidence	<p>Page 80, Column 2, Paragraph 2 (footnote 34) (Page 81, fn 34).</p> <p>In her 1986 dissertation, however, Joan Whittemore takes a detailed look at this issue, using works composed for the <i>ospedali</i> and revised for use elsewhere (or vice versa) <b>to demonstrate the various practices composers may have used in this circumstance.</b></p>	<p>Joan Whittemore clarified not only how the <i>Ospedali</i> were allowed to foster women’s choruses and orchestras through canonical privilege, but demonstrated <b>exactly</b> how fourteen of the <i>maestri</i> actually made the revisions, <i>not</i> as Eanes purports, “the various practices composers <i>may have used</i> in performance.”</p> <p>Fourteen <i>Ospedali</i> composers revised their music in one of two ways:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Music originally written for San Marco or other churches and then revoiced for the <i>figlie del coro</i>.</li> </ol> <p>Andrea Bernasconi, Ferdinando Bertoni, Giuseppe Carcani, Vincenzo Ciampi, Giacchino Cocchi, Bonaventura Furlanetto, Niccolo Jommeli, Gaetano Latilla, Gaetano Pampani, Nicola Porpora, and Antonio Vivaldi.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. Music (SSAA) originally written for the <i>figlie del coro</i> and revised as SATB for San Marco or other churches.</li> </ol> <p>Agostino Perotti, Baldassare Galuppi, Jommelli, Furlanetto, Porpora, and Johann Adolph Hasse.<sup>19</sup></p>

<sup>18</sup> Whittemore, “The Revision Repertoire,” 12

<sup>19</sup> *Ibid.*, 13.

Item	Eanes	Jane Berdes, <i>Women Musicians of Venice</i>
26. Inaccurate Information and lack of documentation	<p>p. 80. Column 3</p> <p>“.. their [the <i>Ospedali</i>] descent was sudden; by the end of that century the <i>ospedali</i> and their <i>cori</i> were in financial ruin, and <b>had all but abandoned their music programs. By the time of the dissolution of the Venetian Republic in 1797 most had turned over their operations to the state and the international audiences for over a century ceased almost completely.</b>”</p>	<p>Finally, Mr. Eanes erroneously reports that the <i>Ospedali cori</i>'s activity's ceased in 1797 with the fall of the Venetian Republic which is a direct contradiction to Jane's Berdes's evidence.</p> <p>The <i>cori</i> did not cease to exist when their parent institutions were closed in 1782 or even after the calamitous disappearance of the Republic itself.<sup>20</sup></p> <p><i>Maestri</i> continued to compose large scale compositions for each of the <i>ospedali</i>. Travelers' commentaries confirm the performance of the <i>cori</i> even after the Fall of the Venetian Republic. Agostino Perotti's last known composition dated for the Pietà is 1840. With his death in 1855, the <i>cori</i> ended.<sup>21</sup></p>

There are additional errata and problems in the tone and language of the article that suggest a mindset that attempts to translate complicated issues from the twelfth through the eighteenth centuries without first clearly understanding how the *Ospedali* functioned in their own milieu. Understanding also requires accurate documentation and representation of the facts. Much of the source material is accessible in English through recent publications, and the *Choral Journal* has previously published several articles on the subject.<sup>22</sup> Given the high editorial and scholarly standards to which the editors of the *Choral Journal* aspire, it is regrettable that Mr. Eanes seriously flawed article found its way into the February issue. Unfortunately given the number and kinds of errata in this essay, the accuracy of other articles in the *Choral Journal* maybe called into question.

Joan Whittemore, CSJ  
February 10, 2009

<sup>20</sup> Berdes, 243, 231-232

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, fn 213, pp. 231-232.

<sup>22</sup> The author is indebted to Martha Hall Ashmore, Ph.D, George Berdes, Rosemary Flanigan, CSJ, Ph.D., and John Walter Hill, Ph.D, Professor Emeritus, Musicology, School of Music, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign for their careful reading of and contributions to this article.